**Molloy College**

**Division of Education**

Student: Gregory Fothergill, Nicole Calvagna, Natalie Kestenbaum Dr. Sheehan

Course EDU 5090 Date: 3/31/20

Grade: 5th Topic: Meeting of the Minds Content Area: Social Studies

**STANDARDS AND INDICATORS**

**NEW YORK STATE SOCIAL STUDIES STANDARDS**

5.3 EUROPEAN EXPLORATION AND ITS EFFECTS: Various European powers explored and eventually colonized the Western Hemisphere. This had a profound effect on Native Americans and led to the transatlantic slave trade. (Standards: 1, 2, 3, 4; Themes: MOV, TCC, GEO, ECO, EXCH)

5.3a Europeans traveled to the Americas in search of new trade routes, including a northwest passage, and resources. They hoped to gain wealth, power, and glory.

5.3b Europeans encountered and interacted with Native Americans in a variety of ways.

***Indicator:*** *This will be evident when students gather information from a meeting of the minds seeking to make an informed decision, based on sound evidence, on whether Columbus was a hero or villain.*

**ELA Standard: New York State Next Generation English Language Arts Learning Standard**

**Speaking and Listening Standard**

**Comprehension and Collaboration**

**5SL1c:**

Pose and respond to specific questions by making comments that contribute to the discussion and elaborate on the remarks of others.

***Indicator:***  *This will be evident when students pose and respond to specific questions by making comments that contribute to the discussion and elaborate on the remarks of others.*

**NCSS Inquiry Standard:**

**NCSS C3 Inquiry Arc**

Dimension 3: Students will work toward conclusions about societal issues, trends, and events by collecting evidence and evaluating its usefulness in developing causal explanations.

***Indicator:*** *This will be evident when students collect evidence and evaluate its usefulness in developing causal explanations.*

Dimension 4: Students will draw on knowledge and skills to work individually and collaboratively to conclude their investigations into societal issues, trends, and events and will present their information, portions and findings.

***Indicator:*** *This will be evident when students present their information, portions and findings by participating in the Meeting of the Minds activity*.

**Social Studies Habits of Mind**

1. **Gathering, Interpreting and Using Evidence**

2. Recognize and effectively select different forms of evidence used to make meaning in social studies (including primary and secondary sources such as art and photographs, artifacts, oral histories, maps, and graphs).

***Indicator:*** *This will be evident when students recognize and effectively select different forms of evidence used to make meaning in social studies when participating in the Meeting of the Minds.*

**INSTRUCTIONAL OBJECTIVE(S)**

After conducting research about certain historical figures with opinions on Columbus’s exploration, students will pose and respond to specific questions by making comments that contribute to the discussion and elaborate on the remarks of others by participating in a Meeting of the Minds Simulation and making more than five sound, relevant contributions to the meeting.

**DEVELOPMENTAL PROCEDURES**

**1. MOTIVATION - Students will be shown a Time Machine picture or video and asked what it would be like if they could go back in time to have a discussion with Columbus in order to get deeper insights into the compelling question.** *(Why did Columbus sail across the Atlantic Ocean from Spain? What was Columbus hoping to find while exploring? Did Columbus find what he was looking for? How did Christopher Columbus treat people? Was Columbus a hero or villain? Explain.)*

2. Students will be assigned a historical figure that was involved with Christopher Columbus.

3. Each child will be given a packet on an assigned character and a list of questions that they are to answer as that character.

4 The characters assigned, Christopher Columbus, Rosario Iaconis, Bartolomeo De La Casas, James Loewen, and a Native American Leader will meet to discuss the compelling question and bring to life different views on Columbus.

5. The students will meet in groups of five with each student participating and answering questions as the character assigned. Characters can challenge each other in a true discussion of the issues and questions surrounding Columbus.

6. Students will complete an exit ticket with their answer to the question of whether Columbus was a hero or villain, and sharing what character most affected their thinking in the meeting.

**ASSESSMENT**

Informal assessment

Teachers will assist and evaluate students in answering the questions assigned before the meeting.

Teacher will evaluate the discussions while walking from group to group.

Formal assessment

Teacher will evaluate the exit slips of the students.

**REFERENCES**

Christopher Columbus. (2019, December 3). Retrieved from

<https://www.biography.com/explorer/christopher-columbus>

Columbus and the Taíno. (2011, June 11). Retrieved from

http://nativeamericannetroots.net/diary/983

[Iaconis: Let's allow Columbus his rightful day on our calendar](https://www.northjersey.com/story/opinion/contributors/2016/10/08/iaconis-lets-allow-columbus-his-rightful-day-on-our-calendar/93044716/). (2016, October 8). Retrieved from http://northjersy.news/2eLeZNr

*K-12 Next Generation ELA Standards at a Glance* [PDF]. (n.d.). NYS Education Department.

Lunenfield, M. (2020, March 02). Las Casas, Bartolomé De (1474–1566). Retrieved from https://www.encyclopedia.com/people/history/latin-american-history-biographies/bartolome-de-las-casas

New York State Education Department. (2015). NYS Standards Retrieved from <http://www.nysed.gov/curriculum-instruction/k-12-social-studies-framework>

MEETING OF THE MINDS PARTICIPANTS

5 Characters

* Columbus
* De La Casas
* Native American Leader
* Rosario Iaconis
* James Loewen

Historical Figure packet

**Christopher Columbus**

Christopher Columbus was an Italian explorer and navigator. In 1492, he sailed across the Atlantic Ocean from Spain in the Santa Maria, with the Pinta and the Niña ships alongside, hoping to find a new route to India. He completed a total of 4 voyages.

Columbus is known for bringing European colonization to America and is blamed for destroying the native people and their islands as he explored.

Although he did not become rich like he had hoped, he is responsible for the transfer of people, plants, animals, diseases and cultures that greatly affected nearly every society on the planet.

**Bartolomeo De La Casas**

Bartolomeo de Las Casas was born in 1484 in Seville, Spain. He grew up to be Roman Priest who was famous for defending the native people of the Americas. In 1492, as a young boy, he saw Columbus come to Seville after his first voyage to Cuba and was inspired.

In 1502, he traveled there himself and witnessed the terrible treatment of the native people because of Columbus. He witnessed the Christians cruelty and stated, “They laid bets as to who, with one stroke of the sword, could split a man in two or could cut off his head or spill out his entrails with a single stroke of the pike.” He was the first person to expose the cruelties of the native people and would defend them and demand better treatment.

**Native American Leader**

Guarionex was a Taino leader that met Columbus during his first voyage, when he claimed to have founded the island of Hispaniola, which is near present day Bahamas. The Taino people had inhabited the island long before Columbus claimed to have founded the land. Guarionex had over tens of thousands of followers all across the island. When Columbus took over, the Taino people accepted them for a while until they couldn’t take anymore. They battled Columbus and his people and were defeated. Columbus had weapons and armor that the Taino had never seen before. In return, Columbus demanded food, coton and gold. Him and his people were causing a food shortage and starvation for the Taino.

**Rosario A. Iaconis**

Rosario is a historian who specializes in Christopher Columbus and is the chairman of the Italian Institute of America.Rosario is currently living today and although he was unable to travel with Christopher Columbus on his numerous voyages he enjoys researching them in his spare time which began as a hobby years ago. Iaconis strongly feels that Christopher Columbus was more of a hero than a villain. He believed that Columbus’s flaws and the bad choices that he made were the main contributors to his qualities that made him great. Rosario felt that the Great Navigator’s journey of discovery joined two worlds. It’s called the Columbian Exchange. Columbus brought the gifts of the Italians to the terra incognita (unknown or unexplored territory) of the Americas — capitalism, the rule of law, the arts, modern science and humanism.

**James Loewen**

James Loewen was born on February 6, 1942 in Decatur, Illinois. He graduated from Harvard

University where he went on to publish his book, “Lies My Teacher Told Me.” He is a Penn State University Professor and a Historian. Although James Loewen was not alive when Columbus was exploring the New World, he is aware of the brutal mistreatment done by Columbus and his men to the native people. He wrote, “When an Indian (native) committed even a minor offense, the Spanish (Columbus’ men) cut off his ears or nose. Disfigured, the person was sent back to his village as living evidence of the brutality the Spaniards were capable of.”

Meeting of the minds questions For Participants

1. State your name and introduce yourself to the group.
2. State your job and explain how you make a living.
3. Why did you want to travel with Columbus?
4. How do you know columbus? When did you meet?
5. Describe what happened when Columbus reached America.

* If you are Columbus, what was it like for you when you first landed in America?

1. Do you think your arrival on the shores lead to more positive outcomes or more harmful outcomes?
2. Was Columbus a villain or a hero? Explain your point of view.

