

Instructional Objectives

After analyzing primary source documents about Thomas Jefferson, Alexander Hamilton, and their position on neutrality, students will participate in a Reading Like a Historian activity where they will *analyze and pull evidence from the documents* to understand Jefferson and Hamilton's foreign policy of neutrality. Students will analyze and compare the primary source documents to the song "Cabinet Battle #2" with 95% accuracy.

Standards and Indicators

New York State Social Studies Standards

11.2d Under the new Constitution, the young nation sought to achieve national security and political stability, as the three branches of government established their relationships with each other and the states.

Indicator: This will be evident when students analyze the primary sources and contrast the political view points of Hamilton and Jefferson when it comes to neutrality.

National Social Studies Standards & Themes

V. Individuals, Groups, & Institutions

Indicator: This will be evident through the student analysis of the primary documents and understanding the political views on Hamilton and Jefferson.

VI. Power, Authority, & Governance

Indicator: This will be evident through the student analysis of the primary documents and understanding the political views on Hamilton and Jefferson.

NCSS C3 Inquiry Arc

Dimension 3: Students will work toward conclusions about societal issues, trends, and events by collecting evidence and evaluating its usefulness in developing causal explanations.

Indicator: This will be evident through the students' analysis and understanding of primary source documents and the completion of the Reading Like a Historian activity.

Common Core ELA Standards

CCSS.RL.11-12.1 Cite strong and thorough textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text, including determining where the text leaves matters uncertain.

Indicator: This will be evident by the student's use of the evidence in the documents to analyze and reflect Hamilton and Jefferson's views on neutrality and the French Revolution.

Social Studies Practices: Habits of Mind

A. Gathering, Interpreting, and Using Evidence

Indicator: This will be evident through the students' analysis of the documents provided during the Reading Like a Historian activity and their ability to find useful information from the documents that can be used to provide evidence.

Motivation

Students will walk into the classroom as the song, "Cabinet Battle #2" from the musical *Hamilton* on the SMARTBoard. After the song has finished playing, the teacher will ask the students, How do we know the facts we read in our textbooks is accurate? Do you believe that the textbook is bias? Why or why not? After a brief class discussion based on those questions, the teacher will introduce the lesson for the day.

Materials

- SMARTBoard
- PowerPoint Presentation
- YouTube clip of "Cabinet Battle #2"
- Primary source documents
- Reading Like a Historian Worksheet
- Writing utensils
- "Cabinet Battle #2" Lyrics

Strategies

- Group Discussion
- Independent Study
- Close Reading
- Reading Like a Historian

Adaptations

- The student who is an English Language Learner will be provided with a sheet of defined vocabulary words from the primary documents that they will use to guide them in their readings.
- The student with a hearing disability will have preferential seating at the front of the room and will be provided with a voice amplifier.
- The student with fine motor issues will be able to use an iPad to complete the primary document worksheets. Student will type answers on the iPad instead of handwriting them.

Differentiation

- Interpersonal learners will be able to work in groups for the Reading Like a Historian activity.
- Introverted students will be able to extract evidence and support their answers through writing while the extroverted learner may present the evidence and conclusions they have come to orally to the class.
- Linguistic learners will be able to read primary source documents from Hamilton and Jefferson during this historical era.
- Auditory learners will be able to listen to class discussion as well as the "Cabinet Battle #2" and be able to make the connections between the class discussions and the song.

Developmental Procedures

1. Motivation: Students will walk into the classroom as the song, “Cabinet Battle #2” from the musical *Hamilton* on the SMARTBoard. After the song has finished playing, the teacher will ask the students, How do we know the facts we read in our textbooks is accurate? Do you believe that the textbook is bias? Why or why not? After a brief class discussion based on those questions, the teacher will introduce the lesson for the day. (*What does it mean to be biased? (Literal) Why do you think I am discussing biased sources and documents with you before reading primary source documents? (Inferential) Why do you think it is important to understand the term biased and how it affects the historical accuracy of a document? (Metacognitive)*)
2. Teacher will handout the Reading Like a Historian activity to the class. The teacher will then briefly walk the students through a Reading Like a Historian activity and demonstrate how the activity works. (*Where can I locate the dictionary based on the types of questions? (Literal) Can these documents be interpreted in multiple ways? (Inferential) How does this activity make you think about bias and the author’s purpose for writing the document? (Metacognitive)*)
3. Students will highlight, analyze, and annotate each document. Following each document is four questions that the students must answer with supporting evidence. (*Who wrote this article and why? (Literal) What historical event is the author referring to when they state, “sense of gratitude to France for the services rendered us in our late contest for independence and liberty” (Inferential) Why do you think George Washington’s tone changed between the two letters? (Metacognitive)*)
4. Teacher will go over documents and questions with the class. This will begin a classroom discussion which all will participate in. (*Who were the authors of these documents? (Literal) Do you see any comparisons or contradictions between these two articles? (Inferential) Why do you think Hamilton and Jefferson had such different viewpoints on neutrality? (Metacognitive)*)

Assessment

The teacher will observe students as they complete their Reading Like a Historian activity. Teacher will listen and interject when necessary in order to help students understand the material. Through class discussion and student’s answers to the questions, the teacher will be able to see if the students understood the material.

Independent Practice

For homework, students will use the primary sources given in class and align quotes from the primary source documents with lyrics in the song “Cabinet Battle #2”. Students will have to provide textual evidence and explain why the quotes and lyrics match up.

Follow Up

Direct Teacher Intervention: Students who did not easily meet the lesson objective will, along with the teacher, engage in a read and retell activity that simplifies Hamilton and Jefferson’s political views on neutrality. Students will also be given a graphic organizer so they can make their thoughts and thinking visible to themselves.

Academic Enrichment: Students who successfully met the lesson objective will chose a side, pro-neutrality or anti-neutrality, and write a paragraph using textual evidence explaining their arguments. Students will make connects to primary source documents, “Cabinet Battle #2” song, and other facts they have learned about Hamilton and Jefferson.

References:

Defense of the President's Neutrality Proclamation, [May 1793]. (n.d.). Retrieved November 08, 2016, from <http://founders.archives.gov/documents/Hamilton/01-14-02-0340>

From George Washington to Thomas Jefferson, 12 April 1793. (n.d.). Retrieved November 08, 2016, from <http://founders.archives.gov/documents/Washington/05-12-02-0353>

George Washington to Alexander Hamilton, April 12, 1793. (n.d.). Retrieved November 8, 2016, from <https://memory.loc.gov/cgi-bin/query/r?ammem/mgw>

Miranda, L. (n.d.). Cabinet Battle #2. Retrieved November 08, 2016, from <http://genius.com/Lin-manuel-miranda-cabinet-battle-2-lyrics>

Thomas Jefferson to William Smith. (n.d.). Retrieved November 08, 2016, from <https://www.loc.gov/exhibits/jefferson/105.html>

Reading Like a Historian

Hamilton vs. Jefferson

Neutrality Documents

Directions: Read the following primary source documents based on Hamilton and Jefferson's views on neutrality. Answer the questions that follow. See dictionary on types of questions on the last page.

“The people are if possible to be made to believe, that the Proclamation of neutrality issued by the President of the US was unauthorized illegal and officious—inconsistent with the treaties and plighted faith of the Nation—inconsistent with a due sense of gratitude to France for the services rendered us in our late contest for independence and liberty—inconsistent with a due regard for the progress and success of republican principles...Pains are likewise taken to inflame the zeal of the people for the cause of France and to excite their resentments against the powers at War with her.”

Alexander Hamilton

Defense of the President's Neutrality Proclamation, May 1793

1. (Sourcing) Who wrote this article and why? Do you think the author has a bias in any way?
2. (Close Reading: Perspective) Does the author support the United States position of neutrality?
3. (Close Reading: Inferential) What historical event is the author referring to when they state, “sense of gratitude to France for the services rendered us in our late contest for independence and liberty”.

4. (Context) What is happening in France from 1789-1799 and how is it affecting the United States foreign policy?

“We have had 13 states independent 11 years. There has been one rebellion. That comes to one rebellion in a century & a half for each state. What country before ever existed a century & half without a rebellion? What country can preserve its liberties if their rulers are not warned from time to time that their people preserve the spirit of resistance? Let them take arms. What signify a few lives lost in a century or two? The tree of liberty must be refreshed from time to time with the blood of patriots & tyrants. It is its natural manure.”

Thomas Jefferson

Letter to William Smith, November 1787

1. (Sourcing) Who wrote the article and why? Does the author have a bias? Create a question that you can ask the author to check their integrity

2. (Close Reading: Inferential and Academic) What does the author mean by, “The tree of liberty must be refreshed from time to time with the blood of patriots & tyrants”?

3. (Close Reading: Perspective) What are the authors views on the French Revolution? Find a quote from the article to support your answer.

4. (Corroboration) How does this document compare/contrast to the first document about neutrality?

“Hostilities having commenced between France and England, it is incumbent on the Government of the United States to prevent, as far as in it lies, all interferences of our Citizens in them... The means to prevent it, and for the United States to maintain a strict neutrality between the powers at war, I wish to have seriously thought of, that I may as soon as I arrive at the Seat of the Government, take such steps, tending to these ends, as shall be deemed proper and effectual.”

George Washington

Letter to Alexander Hamilton, April 12, 1793

“War having actually commenced between France and Great Britain, it behooves the Government of this Country to use every means in it’s power to prevent the citizens thereof from embroiling us with either of those powers, by endeavoring to maintain a strict neutrality. I therefore require that you will give the subject mature consideration, that such measures as shall be deemed most likely to effect this desirable purpose may be adopted without delay; for I have understood that vessels are already designated as Privateers, & preparing accordingly.”

George Washington

Letter to Thomas Jefferson, April 12, 1793

1. (Sourcing) Who is the author of both articles? What is his purpose for writing Hamilton and Jefferson?

2. (Close Reading: Perspective) Between Hamilton and Jefferson, who do you think the author supports more? Whose foreign policy of neutrality does the author seem to side with? Provide evidence.

3. (Context) What are Hamilton and Jefferson’s views on neutrality? How does this effect George Washington’s presidency?

4. (Corroboration) Compare and contrast the two documents. Has the tone of the author changed? Do both documents contain the same content? Provide evidence.

Types of Questions Dictionary

Sourcing: Who wrote the article and what might the author's motivation and personal interests be

Close Reading (Inferential and Academic): What does the document actually say? What do specific phrases and words refer to?

Close Reading (Perspective): Analyze the author's perspective in the article

Context: What else is going on in history at the time the document came out? Does this affect the author's bias, perspective, purpose for writing, etc.

Corroboration: Compare and contrast two documents. Do they contradict one another? Are there many similarities between the two?

Hamilton vs. Jefferson Neutrality Homework

Directions: Below is the lyrics to “Cabinet Battle #2” from Hamilton the Musical. Using the primary source documents from the Reading Like a Historian activity, match up at least 3 quotes from the documents to the lyrics in the song. Fill out the graphic organizer below. Highlight the lyrics you use in your graphic organizer and be sure to include the document number you are using.

[Washington]

The issue on the table: France is on the verge of war with England
And do we provide aid and our troops to our French allies or do we stay out of it?
Remember, my decision on this matter is not subject to congressional approval
The only person you have to convince is me
Secretary Jefferson, you have the floor, sir

[Jefferson]

When we were on death’s door, when we were needy
We made a promise, we signed a treaty
We needed money and guns and half a chance
Who provided those funds?

[Madison]

France

[Jefferson]

In return, they didn’t ask for land
Only a promise that we’d lend a hand
And stand with them if they fought against oppressors
And revolution is messy but now is the time to stand
Stand with our brothers as they fight against tyranny
I know that Alexander Hamilton is here and he
Would rather not have this debate
I’ll remind you that he is not Secretary of State
He knows nothing of loyalty
Smells like new money, dresses like fake royalty
Desperate to rise above his station
Everything he does betrays the ideals of our nation

[Ensemble]
Ooh!!

[Jefferson]
Hey, and if ya don't know, now ya know, Mr. President

[Washington]
Thank you, Secretary Jefferson. Secretary Hamilton, your response

[Hamilton]
You must be out of your Goddamn mind if you think
The President is gonna bring the nation to the brink
Of meddling in the middle of a military mess
A game of chess, where France is Queen and Kingless
We signed a treaty with a King whose head is now in a basket
Would you like to take it out and ask it?
"Should we honor our treaty, King Louis' head?"
"Uh... do whatever you want, I'm super dead."

[Washington]
Enough. Hamilton is right

[Jefferson]
Mr. President—

[Washington]
We're too fragile to start another fight

[Jefferson]
But sir, do we not fight for freedom?

[Washington]
Sure, when the French figure out who's gonna lead 'em

[Jefferson]
The people are leading—

[Washington]
The people are rioting
There's a difference. Frankly, it's a little disquieting you would let your ideals blind you to
reality
Hamilton

[Hamilton]
Sir

[Washington]

Draft a statement of neutrality

[Jefferson]
Did you forget Lafayette?

[Hamilton]
What?

[Jefferson]
Have you an ounce of regret?
You accumulate debt, you accumulate power
Yet in their hour of need, you forget

[Hamilton]
Lafayette's a smart man, he'll be fine
And before he was your friend, he was mine
If we try to fight in every revolution in the world, we never stop
Where do we draw the line?

[Jefferson]
So quick-witted

[Hamilton]
Alas, I admit it

[Jefferson]
I bet you were quite a lawyer

[Hamilton]
My defendants got acquitted

[Jefferson]
Yeah. Well, someone oughta remind you

[Hamilton]
What?

[Jefferson]
You're nothing without Washington behind you

[Washington]
Hamilton!

[Jefferson]
Daddy's calling!

Document Quote	Lyric(s)	Evidence of Character Strengths
